

**ESRC Seminar Series on Teacher Education for the Changing  
Demographics of Schooling: policy, practice and research**

**Seminar 3: Teacher knowledge, skills and values**

## **Embodiment of knowledge and inclusive pedagogy**

Archie Graham, School of Education, University of Aberdeen

1

Presentation, Moray House School of Education,  
The University of Edinburgh,  
8<sup>th</sup> December 2014

# Background

## Preparation of the teacher for:

- Increasingly diverse groups of learners
- Improved student performance
- Inclusion of all learners
- Bridging the theory-practice gap

## Conventional Responses from Teacher Education:

- Add new courses or additional content
- Perpetuate mind/body, theory/practice binaries
- Overlook or pay insufficient attention to the role of the body in the preparation of the teacher

## Some Exceptions to Conventional Responses from Teacher Education:

- Partnership Models (UK)
- Professional development schools (USA)
- Oxford internship scheme

Despite some encouraging progress dichotomies continue e.g. theory/practice.

“...there is an important role for university-based scholars in developing the kind of discourse which bridges the theory-practice gap, so that the innovations of inclusive pedagogy are developed collaboratively with teachers in schools and communicated to students qualifying to be teachers in rigorous, balanced, integrated and practical ways.” McIntyre 2009, p607

Yet, despite the implicit awareness of the role of the body in McIntyre’s assertion there remains a need to explore further how closer (re)attention to the role of the body might offer further insights for the preparation of the teacher for inclusion.

**What insights might we discover if the role of the body is foregrounded in our response to the problem of preparing teachers to teach increasingly diverse student populations?**

## A Phenomenological / Lifeworld Perspective

*(Seeking to understand the lived embodied experience(s) of the person and how they relate to others.)*

The lifeworld is the world experienced through the “...natural primordial attitude...” (Husserl, [1954] 1970: 281) where the term “natural” is understood as original, prior to critical or theoretical reflection, and as such, is a “taken-for-granted” attitude to living in the world.

Our natural attitude results in so much of our everyday living being taken-for-granted that we often fail to notice it, unless something goes wrong and our attention is awakened by some means or another, otherwise a deliberate attempt is required to bring what is taken-for-granted into view.

The aim in phenomenological research is to move beyond the taken-for-granted view of the world and offers a method of getting closer to phenomena/lived experience under investigation by bringing to reflective awareness aspects of the lifeworld that are concealed by our natural attitude.

Also, the phenomenological literature provides a wealth of insight and a web of thinking about the human condition allowing for potential openings and possibilities.

## A phenomenological / lifeworld perspective

Phenomenologist	Key Insight
Husserl [1913] 2001	Consciousness can only engage with the world because we are already in the world. (Noema/Noesis)
Heidegger [1926] 2005	Being situated in the world involves taking a position or adopting a particular perspective which can change over time.
Merleau-Ponty [1945] 1962	Our perception in the world mediates our being-in-the-world and the body is 'the vehicle of being in the world'. Our bodies connect us to the world.
Gadamer [1975] 2006	Every finite present has its limitations. We define the concept of "situation" by saying that it presents a standpoint that limits the possibility of vision. Essential to the concept of situation are the concepts of 'horizon', 'bias' and 'prejudice'. Bringing biases and prejudices to reflective awareness presents an opportunity to replace prior understandings with new ones. ( <i>Change is Possible</i> )

**A phenomenological / lifeworld perspective enables us to tap into our bodily experiences to understand our world (including ourselves and others).**

# Embodiment: Insights from Phenomenology

(Through our bodies and body extensions we perceive the world)

Phenomenologist	Key Insight
Heidegger [1926] 2005	Posits the idea of 'equipment' that extends our bodily presence in the world beyond the limits of our physical bodies. For example our use of equipment extends the reach of the body e.g. the telephone, the microscope.
Merleau-Ponty [1945] 1962	'It is through my body that I understand other people, just as it is through my body that I perceive things'. Our bodies help us interpret the world.
Merleau-Ponty [1945] 1962	Reworks the concept of 'extension' to the body such that objects such as tools can become incorporated into one's body schema. The use of such tools is then the means by which one engages the world (entwinement), rather than as an object in the world that one engages. For example, the scientist's use of a microscope to see more. Body extension can bring about change e.g. in how one sees the world.
Merleau-Ponty [1964] 1968	Reworks 'embodiment' to shift the focus from embodied consciousness to a notion of intercorporeal being / entwinement (we are already entwined with others and things through our activities and projects ) 'The world and I are within one another'
Gadamer [1975] 2006	'It is impossible to make ourselves aware of a prejudice while it is constantly operating unnoticed, but only when it is, so to speak, provoked.' Provoking prejudice enables us to <i>feel</i> the effect of their disruption bringing them to reflexive awareness

## Foregrounding Embodiment: Insights from Phenomenology

Facet of Lived Experience	
(i) Body-world (see slides 8, 11 & 14)	Merging of body and world
(ii) Bodily consciousness (see slides 9,12 & 15)	<b>Subjective body</b> (as lived and experienced)  <b>Objective body</b> (as observed and scientifically investigated)

## Embodiment: A Body-world perspective

*(Drawing from the work of Merleau-Ponty: Merging of body and world)*

Concept	Implication
Intercorporeality	To dissolve the mind/body dichotomy and rework embodiment as an intertwining of body and world. Foregrounds the social nature of the body and the bodily nature of social relationships.
Entwinement	We are already entwined with others and things through our activities and projects. It is through our bodies that we perceive the world. Turning attention to entwinement provides the possibility of bringing us closer to how practice (making the invisible visible) is constituted.
Extension	Our bodies are involved in how we interpret the world and can be extended by equipment/tools/technologies.
Equipment / tools / technologies	Equipment can be understood in terms of physical tools such as pens, wheel chairs, computers for example. But also abstract tools such as conceptual frameworks that support thinking and perception (Sandberg and Dall'Alba, 2009). Accordingly, some 'tools' may be 'invisible' to observation and practitioners may not be cognitively aware that they are using them.



## Embodiment: A Body-consciousness perspective

Phenomenologist	Key Insight	Implication
Merleau-Ponty [1945] 1962	Lived body (subjective body) is an embodied consciousness that dynamically and pre-reflectively engages with the world.	Because we have the capacity to reflect we have the capacity to change the way we do things – reflexivity.
Satre [1943] 1969	When we engage in our everyday life we tend not to be conscious of our bodies and we take them for granted.	We should reflexively examine the taken-for-grantedness of our bodies
Van Manen (1990)	When the body is the object of someone's critical gaze it may turn awkward or under the admiring gaze the body surpasses its normal abilities.	The objectification of the body results in a disruption of the taken-for-grantedness. For example, new teachers may be very conscious of being 'watched' and consequently act (live their bodies) in a more self conscious (interrupted) manner in that moment.
Findlay (2006)	When we are ill, for example, we no longer take the body for granted.	Once brought to consciousness the body is transformed from lived body (subjective body) to body-object (objective body).

*While important balance is necessary. If we are too body-conscious this can potentially undermine practice (e.g. self restriction in terms of how we act)*

# An expanded version of phronesis for inclusive pedagogy (Florian & Graham 2014)

“...phronesis frames the role of the teacher as a thinker, interpreter of social norms and decision-maker, someone who can sensitively exercise professional judgements while simultaneously making sense of complex social and practical situations...” (Florian & Graham, 2014)

Characteristic of Heideggerian Phronesis	Explanation for inclusive pedagogy	Example
<b>Circumspection (understanding)</b>	Teachers take a critical stance towards the pedagogical situation asking whether and how existing practices marginalise or place limits on the learning that is possible for some students.	Teachers imagine the possibilities for transforming the learning environment by extending what is generally available to all learners while taking account of differences between them.
<b>Comportment (demeanour/tact)</b>	Teachers embody an inclusive disposition that is orientated towards ‘everybody’ in the class. Teachers bodily position themselves to support inclusion.	Teachers move around the classroom, providing individual support without stigmatising some students as less able.
<b>Essence (values)</b>	Teachers privilege the notion of everybody and the idea that they are responsible for the learning of all students drawing on specialist knowledge and support as needed to fulfil this responsibility.	Teachers draw upon socio-cultural perspectives on learning that acknowledge the importance of relationships between everybody in the learning environment of the classroom.
<b>Solicitude (care)</b>	Teachers adopt a positive mode of solicitude which ‘leaps ahead’ in order to ensure all students have opportunities for meaningful and self-directed participation in classroom activities	Teachers expand the range of choices of learning opportunities without predetermining or assigning children to differentiated forms of a lesson. The aim is to empower learners to direct the course of their own learning.
<b>Conscience (self-awareness)</b>	Working in tandem with circumspection, conscience is a form of self-awareness that adopts a critical stance relative to the social norms of the ‘bell-curve thinking’ such as ability grouping that underpins many educational practices.	Teachers can imagine and plan learning activities that do not depend on ‘bell-curve thinking’. They seek out and use alternative pedagogical strategies where possible.

# Body-world interaction

Focus on the re-configured entwinement in enacting practice

Example	Implications for Inclusion	Link to Phronesis
<p>Student 1 (extended body) for inclusive practice)</p> <p>Soundly integrated practices</p>	<p>Demonstrates a nuanced understanding of the learners and the learning environment. The conceptual framework is no longer an object in the world and perceived for itself, the <u>conceptual framework</u> is embodied extending the vision of the student in her/his planning and y in everyday practice to manage, organise, analyse , synthesise and operationalise complex information for inclusion. Constantly making alterations in light of the responses from the learners. Additional support is identified and good use is made of teacher time to support learning for all.</p>	<p>Enhanced Circumspection (understanding) –has a more nuanced understanding of the learners, can assimilate large amounts of information, plan and target additional support where necessary.</p> <p>Enhanced Comportment (demeanour/tact) – responds and moves freely and smoothly in a practice situation</p>
<p>Student 2</p> <p>Loosely connected practice</p>	<p>Lacks a nuanced understanding of the learners and the learning environment. The conceptual framework is an object in the world and has not be embodied in the student’s practice. Student struggles to operationalise assessment data for inclusion. Unclear what additional support is necessary consequently ineffective use of teacher time to support all learners. Lack sufficiently nuanced awareness to manage , organise, analyse and synthesise complex information for inclusion. Low level, spontaneous differentiation, in response to the practice situation.</p>	<p>Limited Circumspection (understanding) - lacks focus and nuanced knowledge of the learners and the learning environment.</p> <p>Awkward Comportment (demeanour/tact) – spontaneous insecure responses to practice situation</p>

## Body-consciousness

[Hyperlink to vignette](#)

Possible Responses to Vignette	Implications for Inclusion	Link to phronesis
Body-consciousness leads to the teacher being thrown off course, interpreting the girl's intervention as a subversive act and disciplining the girl in an attempt to regain 'control'.	Teacher fails to recognise the pedagogical potential of the situation. Unsure how to respond, lacks the flexibility to recover, marginalises and excludes.	Limited Consciousness (self-awareness)
Body-consciousness leads to the teacher joining the students in a moment of shared amusement. The teacher then recovers the situation and the students continue with their learning.	Recovery from such an experience of body-consciousness contributes to positive relationship building and inclusion.	Enhanced Consciousness (self-awareness)

Iverson (2007), also working with the idea of embodiment, refers to such moments as **'tipping points'** and underscores that it takes confidence and support to exploit them for everyone's benefit.

While acknowledging Iverson's caveat regarding the challenges inherent in working with body-conscious moments in/for teacher education, if we were to pay more attention to body-consciousness we might open up new spaces for inclusion and help prepare new teachers for when they experience such body-consciousness moments.

## Summary

Problem: To explore how closer (re)attention to the role of the body might offer further insights for the preparation of the teacher for inclusion.

- Adopting a lifeworld perspective aims to get closer to the lived experience under investigation by bringing to reflective awareness aspects of the lifeworld that are concealed by our natural attitude (taken-for-granted).
- Two facets of lived experience (i) body-world and (ii) bodily consciousness provide different openings for exploring practice.
- A body-world perspective, as explored here, foregrounds entwinement in the examination of practice and seeks to make visible the invisible. For example, extensions to the body for interpreting the practice world.
- A bodily-conscious perspective, as explored here, foregrounds the possibility of opening up new spaces (bodily-conscious moments) for understanding the role of the teacher in and for inclusion.
- Foregrounding the role of the body points to seeking a more nuanced understanding of practice and phronesis for inclusion.
- The re/configured entwinement of the practitioner's world becomes the focus for researching practice seeking to make the invisible the visible in terms of teacher knowledge(s), skills and values.
- Further understanding of the role of the body in the preparation of the teacher is required in understanding what inclusive practitioners know, do, and value.

*A phenomenological / lifeworld approach highlights the need for the body to be (re)introduced into teacher education in addressing the problem of the knowledge base for teacher preparation.*

## Implications for further research (**body-world interaction**)

Key Insight	Possible Future Research
<p>From a lifeworld perspective, entwinement is the point of departure both theoretically and methodologically for investigating practice. Accordingly, there is a shift away from focusing on characteristics of activities, people, concerns, and tools to focus on the re-configured entwinement in enacting practice. Seek to making the 'invisible' visible.</p>	<p>RQ How do teacher (re) configure their lifeworlds for inclusion?</p> <p>RQ What, if any, 'extensions' to the body do inclusive practitioners embody?</p>
<p>One's sense of embodiment is transformed through the extension of the body</p> <p>'technologies are not neutral instruments, but offer affordances or openings for certain kinds of activities.' DA&amp;B 2005;p732</p>	<p>RQ Would a lifeworld perspective highlight features of inclusive pedagogy not captured in the Framework for Participation (Florian &amp; Black-Hawkins, 2011)?</p> <p>RQ If inclusive practitioners embody 'body extensions' which 'extensions' to the body are most appropriate for inclusion?</p>

## Implications for further research (body-consciousness )

Key Insight	Possible Future Research
<p>Once brought to consciousness the body is transformed from lived body (subjective body) to body-object (objective body). The objectification of the body results in a disruption of the taken-for-granted.</p>	<p>RQ How might teachers become more aware/attuned to body-conscious situations that exclude/include learners?</p> <p>RQ How do teachers experience ‘moments’ of body objectivity in their teaching?</p>
<p>We should examine the taken-for-grantedness of the body in the preparation of the teacher.</p> <p>Potential link to helping new teachers handle challenging situations, while building/maintaining positive relationships.</p>	<p>RQ How prepared are new teachers to deal with ‘moments’ of body objectivity in their teaching?</p> <p>RQ Does foregrounding ‘moments’ of body objectivity in teacher education support inclusive practices?</p>
<p>If we don’t run away from the body we might open new spaces for understanding the role of the teacher for inclusion.</p> <p>What if we could use body-conscious ‘moments’ to open new spaces to further teacher knowledge about inclusion.</p>	<p>RQ Can reflection on ‘moments’ of body objectivity enhance teacher reflexivity for inclusion?</p> <p>RQ How might we use moments of body-consciousness to prepare teachers for practice?</p>

## References

- Finlay, L. (2006) The body's disclosure in phenomenological research. *Qualitative Research in Psychology*, Vol. 3, pp. 19–30.
- Florian, L. and Black-Hawkins, K. (2011). Exploring inclusive pedagogy. *British Educational Research Journal*, Vol. 37(5), pp 813-828
- Florian, L. & Graham, A. (2014) Can an expanded interpretation of phronesis support teacher professional development for inclusion? *Cambridge Journal of Education*, Vol.44, No.4, pp4 65-478
- Gadamer, H.G., (2006). *Truth and Method*. (Weinsheimer, J. and Marshall, D.G. trans) London: Sheed, Ward and Continuum Publishing Group. [Original work published 1975].
- Heidegger, M., (2005). *Being and Time*. (MacQuarrie. E. J. & Robinson, E. trans). Oxford: Blackwell Publishing. [Original work published 1926].
- Husserl, E., (2001). *Logical Investigations, Vol. 1*. (Findlay, J.N. trans). London: Routledge. [Original work published 1913].
- Husserl, E., (1970). *The Crisis of European Sciences and Transcendental Phenomenology*. Illinois: Northwestern University Press. [Original work published, 1954].
- Ivinson, G. (2007). Pedagogic discourse and sex education: myths, science and subversion, *Sex Education: Sexuality, Society and Learning*, Vol. 7(2), pp 201-216
- McIntyre, D. (2009). The difficulties of inclusive pedagogy for initial teacher education and some thoughts on the way forward. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, Vol.25, pp602-608
- Merleau-Ponty, M., (1968). *The Visible and Invisible* [Lingis, A., trans]. London: Routledge. [Original work published, 1964].
- Merleau-Ponty, M., (1962). *The Phenomenology of Perception* [Smith, C., trans]. London: Routledge. [Original work published, 1945].
- Sandberg, J. and Dall'Alba, G. (2009). Returning to Practice Anew: A Life-World Perspective. *Organization Studies*, Vol. 30, No. 12, pp 1349–1368
- Satre, J.P. (1969) *Being and Nothingness: An Essay on Phenomenological Ontology*. London: Routledge
- Scottish Executive (2005) *Learning in Two Plus Languages: Ensuring Effective Inclusion of Bilingual Learners*. Learning and Teaching Scotland
- Van Manen, M., (1990). *Researching Lived Experience*. USA: The State University of New York.



(Student 1) PGDE Student's (3 weeks of School Experience) use of a planning template to consider prior learning and any additional support (highlights in original) for inclusion - extending the body to 'see' more.

	<u>What do the children bring?</u>	<u>What are the task demands?</u>	<u>What additional support needs to be planned?</u>
<u>Social</u>	Class have worked with me in a carousel situation before. They know what to do when they hear the timer, understand the concept. They work well in <b>collaboration</b> although some boys, as well as J and K cannot productively work together. Class are on a whole accepting of each other and differing abilities are supported ( <b>Diversity</b> )	Groups will need to be well balanced to ensure that all can <b>access</b> the learning, e.g. L will benefit from being in a group that is able to kindly work with and help her. Group of all boys will lead to distraction, K will benefit from a group that stays focused easily to help keep him on task.	I will pre decide the groups so that I can be sure that they are evenly spread with a range of abilities. This will help L, J and K as there will be children in the group capable of more challenging roles, thus they will better access the learning. Ensure that L is with the girls who work productively with her (K is best).
<u>Cognitive</u>	Class have spent 2 lessons looking at the eat well plate and food pyramid. They understand the concept of a balanced diet and know what foods they should eat the most of.	Lots of new info this week, class will need refresher session to ensure they are familiar with the info that they need to know.	I will have a refresher in the input, ask open questions to spark a discussion about what they have learned during the week. There will be a <b>diverse</b> range of tasks and ability within these to allow for all to participate.
<u>Linguistic</u>	Familiar with words related to the task such as dairy, protein etc and what foods fall into these categories.	Lots of instructions to follow as well as remembering new words from the lessons earlier in the week.	I will clearly explain each station whilst the class is on the carpet. I will do thumbs up at each station and take questions, as well as helping groups who need it, i.e. L, J and K.



## Vignette - Body-consciousness

“...in one biology lesson as part of the national curriculum science syllabus entitled ‘Life processes and the organisation of living things’, a male teacher in a year nine (students aged 13/14 years) lesson was using a worksheet entitled ‘Keeping the Body in a Steady State’. The syllabus stated that ‘They [students] should consider how hormones can be used to control and promote fertility’. A girl interrupted by calling out:

What are hormone tablets? My aunt May said you get things growing in and out that you don’t want. (Year nine girl, co-education class)

The class collapsed into laughter...” Ivinson (2007: 208)

