Educational interventions for professionals implementing supported self-management: a systematic review from the IMP²ART programme

1Nicola McCleary, 2Amanda Andrews, 3Audrey Buelo, 4Susan Morrow, 3Sharon Wiener-Ogilvie, 2Monica Fletcher, 4Liz Steed, 4Steph Taylor, Hilary Pinnock, for the IMP²ART group

1University of Edinburgh; 2Education for Health, 3NHS Education for Scotland; 4Queen Mary University of London;

Background
Supported self-management for asthma reduces use of healthcare resources, improves asthma control and quality of life.


Professional education is a key component of implementation

Aim

To synthesise evidence regarding the effectiveness of educational interventions for professionals supporting self-management amongst people with asthma or diabetes (a comparator long-term condition)

Characteristics
15 studies of asthma

Where?
1993-2016

When?
2 targeted paediatricians
2 targeted nurses
3 targeted primary care physicians/GPs
8 targeted multiple practice members

What?
5 evaluated the Physician Asthma Care PACE programme
4 focussed on communication, patient/family education
1 evaluated a learning collaborative project
5 focussed on general management of asthma

Effectiveness

Process outcomes: provision/receipt of action plans (n=6)

Significant benefit
• Clark 1998, USA
• Shah 2011, Australia
• Sheikh 2016, USA

No effect
• Evans 1997, USA
• Homer 2005, USA
• Tomson 1997, Sweden

Inconsistent
• Cabana 2006, USA
• Clark 1998, USA
• Griffiths 2016, UK
• Evans 1997, USA

Health outcomes (n=14)

Significant benefit
• Cohen 2014, Israel

No effect
• Shah 2011, Australia
• Bruzzone 2006, USA
• Cleland 2007, UK
• Griffiths 2016, UK
• Homer 2005, USA
• Smeele 1999, Netherlands
• Toelle 1993, Australia
• Tomson 1997, Sweden
• Volkovit 2003, Israel

Features of effective interventions

Selection of papers

22,269 records identified
6,976 titles and abstracts
237 full text papers
34 articles reporting 23 trials:

EPOC strategies
✓ Effective interventions n=10
✗ Ineffective interventions n=11

Educational meetings 90% 91%
Educational materials 100% 100%
Clinical practice guidelines 90% 64%
Local opinion leaders 60% 9%
Multi-professional education 50% 9%

TDF features
✓ Effective interventions n=10
✗ Ineffective interventions n=11

Knowledge 100% 100%
Skills 90% 64%
Social influences 80% 18%
Environment/resources 60% 36%
Behavioural regulation 60% 27%
Beliefs about consequences 50% 18%
Professional role 50% 0%
Reinforcement 20% 9%
Belief in capability 20% 0%
Memory/decision processes 20% 0%
Goals 10% 0%

Implications

Features that we should consider including in our IMP²ART implementation strategy:

• Explicitly basing education on guidelines
• Addressing beliefs about consequences
• Focussing on skills development
• Involving local opinion leaders
• Including all members of the practice team
• Addressing professional role and identity, and social influences,
• Adapting to environmental context and resources,
• Considering behavioural regulation

Methods

Systematic review using Cochrane methodology

Trials of education skilling professionals to provide supported self-management (asthma and diabetes)

• 13 electronic databases; 2 trial registries; citation tracking
• Two independent reviewers; Cochrane Risk of Bias tool

Narrative synthesis informed by: Effective Practice and Organisation of Care (EPOC) strategies and Theoretical Domains Framework (TDF)


Health outcomes (n=14)

Significant benefit
• Cohen 2014, Israel

No effect
• Shah 2011, Australia
• Bruzzone 2006, USA
• Cleland 2007, UK
• Griffiths 2016, UK
• Homer 2005, USA
• Smeele 1999, Netherlands
• Toelle 1993, Australia
• Tomson 1997, Sweden
• Volkovit 2003, Israel

Features of effective interventions

Selection of papers

22,269 records identified
6,976 titles and abstracts
237 full text papers
34 articles reporting 23 trials:

EPOC strategies
✓ Effective interventions n=10
✗ Ineffective interventions n=11

Educational meetings 90% 91%
Educational materials 100% 100%
Clinical practice guidelines 90% 64%
Local opinion leaders 60% 9%
Multi-professional education 50% 9%

TDF features
✓ Effective interventions n=10
✗ Ineffective interventions n=11

Knowledge 100% 100%
Skills 90% 64%
Social influences 80% 18%
Environment/resources 60% 36%
Behavioural regulation 60% 27%
Beliefs about consequences 50% 18%
Professional role 50% 0%
Reinforcement 20% 9%
Belief in capability 20% 0%
Memory/decision processes 20% 0%
Goals 10% 0%

Implications

Features that we should consider including in our IMP²ART implementation strategy:

• Explicitly basing education on guidelines
• Addressing beliefs about consequences
• Focussing on skills development
• Involving local opinion leaders
• Including all members of the practice team
• Addressing professional role and identity, and social influences,
• Adapting to environmental context and resources,
• Considering behavioural regulation

Methods

Systematic review using Cochrane methodology

Trials of education skilling professionals to provide supported self-management (asthma and diabetes)

• 13 electronic databases; 2 trial registries; citation tracking
• Two independent reviewers; Cochrane Risk of Bias tool

Narrative synthesis informed by: Effective Practice and Organisation of Care (EPOC) strategies and Theoretical Domains Framework (TDF)