

An Evaluation of International Pandemic Recovery Strategies and Identification of Good Practice Relevant to Scotland: Figures and Tables

Emily Adams*, Damilola Iduye*, Emilie McSwiggan*, Dudzai Mureyi*, Madhurima Nundy*,
Nadege Atkins, Udani de Silva, Kirsten Duggan, Ryan Ferguson, Prerna Krishan, Sarah Barrie,
Jasmin Rostron, Marshall Dozier, Gwenetta Curry, Evropi Theodoratou#, Ruth McQuillan#

*Joint first authors #Joint last authors

**Usher Network for COVid-19 Evidence Reviews (UNCOVER), Usher
Institute, University of Edinburgh**



Contents

Table 1: Summary of Included Policies	3
Table 2: Policy Documents and Indicators Used to Identify Comparator Countries	4
Table 3: Screening Criteria by Theme	5
Table 4: Data Extraction Items.....	6
Table 5: Comparator countries ordered by Gini coefficient (most unequal to least unequal) (Financial security for low-income households)	7
Table 6: Policy themes present in budgetary documents from comparator countries (Financial security for low-income households)	8
Table 7: Policy themes identified in comparator countries (Wellbeing of children and young people)	9
Table 8: COVID recovery policies, strategies and plans – heat map of cross-cutting themes (some policies fall under more than one theme)	10
Figure 1: Good, green jobs and fair work policy themes ranked by priority (based on funds earmarked/pledged or emphasis in climate action blueprint)	11
Box 1: Exemplar policy – Financial security for low-income households	12
(Australia).....	12
Box 2: Exemplar policy – Good, green jobs and fair work (Ireland)	13
Box 3: Exemplar policy: Wellbeing of children and young people (France)	14

Table 1: Summary of Included Policies

Policy	Source	Focus	Jurisdiction	Status	Date of publication /release/enactment
<i>Transform, Heal, and Renew by Investing in a Vibrant Economy (“THRIVE”)</i>	Boyle et al (2021)	Green recovery	USA - federal	Policy proposal	September 2020
<i>California COVID-19 Recovery Deal</i>	Boyle et al (2021)	Green recovery	USA – state (California)	Policy proposal	May 2020
<i>Relaunch France</i>	Geels et al (2022)	Green recovery	France	Enacted policy	Sep 2020
<i>Economic Crisis Management Package and Future Package</i>	Geels et al (2022)	Green recovery	Germany	Enacted policy	June 2020
<i>Future Package</i>	Geels et al (2022)	Green recovery	Germany	Enacted policy	June 2020
<i>Plan for Jobs (PfJ)</i>	Geels et al (2022)	Green recovery	UK	Enacted policy	July 2020
<i>Ten Point Plan for a Green Industrial Revolution (TPP)</i>	Geels et al (2022)	Green recovery	UK	Enacted policy	November 2020
<i>Plan de Recuperación, Transformación y Resiliencia</i>	Vaquero et al (2021)	Green recovery	Spain	Enacted policy	October 2020
<i>Draft Recovery and Resilience Plan (green recovery component)</i>	Dumitrescu (2021)	Green recovery	Poland	Draft policy	February 2021 (draft published for public consultation)
<i>Proximity networks, structures and telemedicine for territorial healthcare assistance</i>	Filippini and Vinceti (2021)	Health	Italy	Policy proposal	June and July 2021
<i>Innovation, research and digitisation of the National Health System</i>	Filippini and Vinceti (2021)	Health	Italy	Policy proposal	June and July 2021
<i>Social Investment Policy</i>	Guillen et al (2022)	Social investment	Spain	Draft policy	April 2021 (draft submitted to EU)
<i>Social Investment Policy</i>	Guillen et al (2022)	Social investment	Italy	Draft policy	April 2021 (draft submitted to EU)
<i>First Right - Housing Access Support Programme</i>	Jorge (2022)	Housing	Portugal	Enacted policy	June 2018 (subsequently incorporated into Recovery and Resilience Plan)

Refer to the reference list in the main report for full details of referenced studies

Table 2: Policy Documents and Indicators Used to Identify Comparator Countries

Theme	Financial security for low-income households	Wellbeing of children and young people	Good, green jobs and fair work
Policy document(s)	Covid Recovery Strategy: For a fairer future (Scottish Government, 2021a)	Getting it right for every child (Scottish Government, 2022)	Three Scottish and international Just Transition reports (International Labour Organisation, 2015; Pinker, 2020; Scottish Government, 2021b)
Indicators	Gross National Income (GNI) Human Development Index (HDI) Gross Household Disposable Income (GHDI) Income inequality (GINI coefficient)	Selected OECD countries similar to Scotland on at least three of the following indicators: Child poverty rate (%) Infant mortality rate Adolescent mortality rate (10 – 19 years) Participation rate: early childhood education enrolment rate (OECD) - 3-year-olds Participation rate: early childhood education enrolment rate (OECD) - 4-year-olds Not in education, employment or training (NEET) rate (%)	-Level of socioeconomic reliance on carbon fuels (oil, gas, coal and peat) - The implementation of interventions that Scotland is also considering -Climate – regions whose climate is comparable to Scotland’s were considered. -Nature of political system – countries that have both federal and devolved political systems - similar to Scotland, which exists in the broader context of the United Kingdom

International Labour Organisation. (2015). *Guidelines for a just transition towards environmentally sustainable economies and societies for all*. Geneva: International Labour Organisation
Retrieved from https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/@ed_emp/@emp_ent/documents/publication/wcms_432859.pdf

Pinker, A. (2020). *Just Transitions: a comparative perspective*. Just Transition Commission Retrieved from <https://www.gov.scot/binaries/content/documents/govscot/publications/independent-report/2020/08/transitions-comparative-perspective2/documents/transitions-comparative-perspective/transitions-comparative-perspective/govscot%3Adocument/transitions-comparative-perspective.pdf>

Scottish Government. (2021a). *Covid Recovery Strategy: for a fairer future*. Edinburgh: The Scottish Government Retrieved from <https://www.gov.scot/publications/covid-recovery-strategy-fairer-future/>

Scottish Government. (2021b). *Just Transition - A Fairer, Greener Scotland: Scottish Government response*. Retrieved from <https://www.gov.scot/publications/transition-fairer-greener-scotland/>

Scottish Government. (2022). *Getting it right for every child (GIRFEC)*. <https://www.gov.scot/policies/girfec/>

Table 3: Screening Criteria by Theme

<p>Financial security for low-income households</p>	<p>I. Include policy that directly addresses Covid recovery rather than immediate response. Specifically, socioeconomic policy measures or programmes implemented in the medium term (one to a few years) with a focus on providing financial aid to low-income households as a result of the economic challenges in COVID-19, and usually involves planned, intentional action</p> <p>II. Exclude short-term or emergency economic policies/measures without a future scope OR those that did not extend beyond 2020</p> <p>III. Exclude economic policy directed at businesses, banks, and tax reforms UNLESS specifically addressing resilience for low-income households.</p> <p>IV. Exclude education and child benefits in concurrence with theme 2 UNLESS specifically addressing resilience for low-income households. (if found in extraction signpost to this team)</p> <p>V. Include policies regarding unemployment due to the increased likelihood of disproportionate impact on low-income workers/households</p> <p>VI. Include policies regarding disabilities and other inequities as the Scottish Government (SG) has identified these populations as at increased risk of financial insecurity.</p> <p>VII. Additional inclusion requested by SG: a policy that addresses the cost-of-living crisis for low-income families</p>
<p>Wellbeing of children and young people</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Include policies that explicitly mention COVID or recovery • Include policies pre-dating COVID if they have been repackaged as COVID recovery policies • Include policies that specifically mention focus on children and young people • Exclude policies that focus on training or upskilling without specific or clearly articulated focus on young people
<p>Good, green jobs and fair work</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Include policies directly address green recovery and creation of fair work rather than immediate responses like stimulus packages. • Exclude policies about work outside the context of the green economy unless the policies are about helping workers that are migrating from the high-carbon energy sector.

Table 4: Data Extraction Items

<p>Financial security for low-income households</p>	<p>Policy title or description; Source; Country / region; Summary of policy; Definition of low income; Whether the policy has been evaluated; Current stage of implementation; Whether federal or regional; Priority areas addressed by the policy; Budget; Does policy address pre-existing inequalities; Benefits; Alignment with the Scottish Government’s Recovery Plan; Additional information</p>
<p>Wellbeing of children and young people</p>	<p>Policy title or description; Source; Country / region; Objective; Date of publication; Date of policy launch; Policy implementation stage; Budget (proposed or allocated); Authority proposing the policy; Target population; Specified age (if applicable); Evidence used for policy development; Stakeholder engagement; Priority areas addressed by the policy; Description of health and safety (mental health); Description of education; Description of employment, training and apprenticeship; Does policy address pre-existing inequalities?; Processes for monitoring and evaluation; What actor(s) / organization(s) are involved or expected to be involved in delivering the intervention; Alignment with the Scottish Government’s Recovery Plan</p>
<p>Good, green jobs and fair work</p>	<p>Policy title or description; Source; Country / region; Whether the policy has been evaluated; Current stage of implementation; Whether federal or regional; Priority areas addressed by the policy; Date launched; Budget; Evidence of procedural justice / social dialogue; Evidence of distributive justice; Alignment of employment creation goals with climate goals; Does policy address pre-existing inequalities; Incentives; Trigger events (e.g. COVID);</p>

**Table 5: Comparator countries ordered by Gini coefficient (most unequal to least unequal)
(Financial security for low-income households)**

Countries	GNI per capita (USD, 2020)	HDI (2022)	GDHI per capita (USD)	Gini Coefficient
Scotland (UK)	45,870	0.932	33,049	0.366
Australia	52,230	0.938	37,433	0.325
Switzerland	69,170	0.946	39,697	0.311
Luxembourg	83,230	0.909	44,773	0.305
Canada	46,050	0.922	34,421	0.301
The Netherlands	58,240	0.933	34,984	0.296

Table 6: Policy themes present in budgetary documents from comparator countries (Financial security for low-income households)

Country	Theme 1: Measures for loss of jobs or unemployment Measures for loss of jobs or unemployment	Theme 2: Income specific policies	Theme 3: Affordable housing policies	Theme 4: Family support-specific policies	Theme 5: Policies for people with disabilities	Theme 6: Policies for vulnerable populations	Theme 7: Social welfare and benefits	Theme 8: Cost of living interventions for low-income families
Australia	x	x	x	x	x	x		x
Switzerland				x	x		x	
Canada	x	x	x	x	x	x		
Luxembourg	x		x		x			
The Netherlands				x			x	

Details of sub-themes by country are provided in Appendix 4: Supplementary Table 4.1


Table 7: Policy themes identified in comparator countries (Wellbeing of children and young people)

Country	Theme 1: Childcare	Theme 2: Education	Theme 3: Employment and upskilling
Australia	x	x	
Belgium		x	x
Finland		x	x
France		x	x
Germany	x	x	x

Table 8: COVID recovery policies, strategies and plans – heat map of cross-cutting themes (some policies fall under more than one theme)

	Income support/ cost of living / addressing poverty	Creating employment opportunities/ tackling unemployment	Supporting families	Addressing inequalities	Education and training	Digitisation and innovation	Reducing GHG emissions	Natural resources
Financial security for low-income households	Canada - 10 Australia - 6 Luxembourg - 2 Switzerland - 2 Netherlands - 1	Australia - 5 Canada - 5 Luxembourg - 2	Australia - 3 Switzerland - 1 Netherlands - 1	Canada - 7 Australia - 5 Luxembourg - 1	Australia - 1 Luxembourg - 1			
Good, green jobs and fair work	Ireland - 1 Canada - 1	Canada - 3 Ireland - 2 Germany - 1 Norway - 1		Canada - 1 Ireland - 1	Germany - 1 Norway - 1	Germany - 2 Canada - 2 Norway - 1 Ireland - 1	Norway - 4 Ireland - 4 Canada - 4 Germany - 3 Oregon - 1 Washington - 1 California - 1 Maine - 1	Canada - 3 Norway - 1 Ireland - 1 Maine - 1
Wellbeing of children and young people	Australia - 2 Germany - 1	Finland - 5 Australia - 3 Germany - 2 France - 2 Belgium - 2	Australia - 3 Germany - 1	Australia - 5 Finland - 2 Germany - 1 France - 1	Australia - 3 Germany - 3 Finland - 3 Belgium - 2 France - 2	Germany - 1 Belgium - 1 Finland - 1 France - 1		
Total policies, plans or strategies that address each theme	26	33	9	24	17	10	18	6

Figure 1: Good, green jobs and fair work policy themes ranked by priority (based on funds earmarked/pledged or emphasis in climate action blueprint)



Decreasing priority/emphasis

Country	Policy Theme				
Canada	Decarbonising and investing in cleaner energy sources	Green Knowledge, Innovation, Research and Development	Energy Efficient Retrofits, renovations, and constructions	Nature-based Solutions and Agricultural Sector Investments	Energy sector transition - helping workers to transition
Germany	Decarbonising and investing in cleaner energy sources	Green Knowledge, Innovation, Research and Development	Energy Efficient Retrofits, renovations, and constructions	Energy sector transition - helping workers to transition	Nature-based Solutions and Agricultural Sector Investments
Norway	Decarbonising and investing in cleaner energy sources	Green Knowledge, Innovation, Research and Development	Nature-based Solutions and Agricultural Sector Investments	Energy sector transition - helping workers to transition	Energy Efficient Retrofits, renovations, and constructions
Ireland	Decarbonising and investing in cleaner energy sources	Energy Efficient Retrofits, renovations, and constructions	Energy sector transition - helping workers to transition	Nature-based Solutions and Agricultural Sector Investments	Green Knowledge, Innovation, Research and Development

Box 1: Exemplar policy – Financial security for low-income households

Australia's cost of living crisis policies

A central theme of the 2022–23 Budget is 'cost of living relief'. The Budget announced an \$8.6 billion cost of living package aimed at helping Australians combat rising living expenses linked to recent surges in petrol prices and relatively high consumer price inflation.

A) *'One-off cost of living tax offset'* (Theme 8)

The Government is providing a one-off, income tax-exempt payment of \$250. They assert that this payment will help 6 million people, at a cost of \$1.5 billion. Importantly, more than half of those who will benefit are pensioners. It was paid automatically to all eligible pensioners, welfare recipients, veterans and eligible concession card holders in April 2022.

B) *'Temporary fuel excise relief'* (Theme 8)

The Australian government states the Russian invasion of Ukraine has seen fuel prices increase, adding to cost of living pressures faced by families. Therefore, the Government proposed taking decisive, responsible and temporary action to cut fuel excise and reduce the pressure of high fuel prices on household budgets. They will reduce fuel excise by 50 per cent for 6 months. This will see excise on petrol and diesel cut from 44.2 cents per litre to 22.1 cents per litre. Fuel subject to a lower excise rate is expected to flow through to the majority of service stations and Australian consumers within a few weeks as stations replenish their stocks.

C) *'Cost of living tax offset'* (Theme 2)

The 2022–23 Budget announcement means that low and middle income earners will receive a one-off tax offset of \$420, in addition to the existing LMITO \$1,080 offset, bringing the full offset to \$1,500 per person. Taxpayers will receive this one-off tax offset when they lodge their tax returns from 1 July 2022. The full offset of \$1,500 will only be available to individuals with an annual taxable income between \$48,001 and \$90,000. This is because the tax offset offered by the LMITO starts to phase out above the \$90,000 threshold, reaching zero at an annual taxable income of \$126,000. At the same time, the benefit from the LMITO declines if a person's taxable income is below \$48,000 and disappears entirely for those with no assessable income.

(Australia)

Box 2: Exemplar policy – Good, green jobs and fair work (Ireland)

Ensuring a Just Transition in the Midlands region in Ireland – towards the abandonment of a carbon fuel (Government of Ireland, 2021)

Problem: The lowering of greenhouse emissions is key for Ireland to achieve its climate action goals yet transition from peat-based power generation will disproportionately impact the population in Ireland’s Midlands region which has long depended on peat extraction as an economic activity and peat as a high-carbon raw material for electricity generation. Although the Midlands Just Transition policy is now discussed in the context of Ireland’s green recovery post-COVID-19, it was conceived prior to the COVID-19 pandemic.

Goals: To cease peat-fired electricity generation by 2023.

To achieve that while maintaining the Midlands’ socioeconomic & cultural vibrancy through green employment creation.

Milestones A Just Transition commission was established, to lead the social dialogue around this plan.

Two of the three electricity generation plants that relied on peat have already been shut down.

126 million Euro in funds for rehabilitating peat extraction bogs has been committed -co-financed by government and a semi-state-owned energy company.

20 million Euro has been committed towards making at least 750 low-income homes more energy efficient. All this funding comes from increased carbon tax revenue, funds from energy sector companies’ profits as well as disbursements from the European Union’s Just Transition Fund.

Training, reskilling, and enterprise support to enable the Midlands population to take advantage of emerging work opportunities is ongoing. For instance, the Technological University of the Shannon: Midlands was opened in October 2021 and remote co-working hubs are being set up to enable people to remain in the Midlands and exploit economic opportunities instead of leaving in search of economic opportunities elsewhere.

Grants worth at least 3.1 million Euro have been awarded to different recipients in the Midlands region to begin the work around retrofitting homes, setting up a Headquarters for climate action research & green business enterprises, and setting up digital learning hubs.

Box 3: Exemplar policy: Wellbeing of children and young people (France)

1 young person, 1 solution

The French Government developed the **1 young person - 1 solution** policy (Gouvernement [French Government], 2020) as a part of its Recovery Plan to address the impact of the COVID-19 pandemic on youth employment and training since August 2020. An investment of EUR 4.6 billion has been allocated for youth employment and development of a more inclusive education system (European Commission, 2021b).

Target Population

All people under 30 years of age who are looking for a job, an apprenticeship, training, or another pathway into professional integration are eligible. Special attention is given to disadvantaged youth, disabled workers and students who do not benefit from cultural and social networks likely to support their academic and professional ambitions (Republique Francaise, undated).

Focus areas

This raft of policies focuses on supporting young people to highlight their strengths and assets, to acquire a range of job searching techniques, to understand the expectations of recruiters and to broaden their professional targets. One-to-one mentorship is provided to work on skills, provide social, sporting and cultural support and identify different professional opportunities.

Accommodation and catering is also provided for young students. Training courses target strategic sectors of the economy, including digital skills, ecological transition, and sectors of the economy keen to attract new recruits (e.g., health and social care and the agri-food and other industrial sectors). Bursaries, stipends, grants, and remuneration are offered to employers who are hiring more young people than they were in 2020.

Policy Assessment

European Commission

An evaluation of the policy by the European Commission found that since August 2020, more than two million young people have benefited from its programmes. 90,000 youth have been trained in jobs in strategic sectors of recovery such as ecological transition, digital, health or industry. The success of the *1 young person, 1 solution* plan has been possible thanks to the exceptional mobilisation of the public and private sector to support young people (European Commission, 2021a, 2021c; Republique Francaise, 2022).

French Recovery Plan Evaluation Committee

An evaluation of the policy by the French Recovery Plan Evaluation Committee found that the employment rate of young people in France has already returned to its pre-crisis level per their assessment at the end of August 2021 (Republique Francaise, undated). By the end of August 2021, EUR 5.1 billion had been committed under the *1 young person, 1 solution* plan and EUR 3.6 billion disbursed, enabling the allocation of just over 2.1 million subsidies, whether in the form of hiring or work-study bonuses, support programmes or training. Measures to facilitate entry into the labour market were implemented rapidly, funding 450,000 new hires and 850,000 entries into work-study training contracts by the end of September 2021 (Republique Francaise, undated).

- European Commission. (2021a). *1 young person 1 solution*.
- European Commission. (2021b). *France's recovery and resilience plan*. Retrieved 30/11/2022 from https://ec.europa.eu/info/business-economy-euro/recovery-coronavirus/recovery-and-resilience-facility/frances-recovery-and-resilience-plan_en
- European Commission. (2021c). *NextGenerationEU: European Commission endorses France's €39.4 billion recovery and resilience plan*. Retrieved 30/11/2022 from https://ec.europa.eu/commission/presscorner/detail/en/ip_21_3153
- Gouvernement [French Government]. (2020). *#1JEUNE1SOLUTION: Au sortir de la crise de la Covid-19, accompagner les 16-25 ans pour construire leur avenir*.
- Republique Francaise. (2022). *Youth Plan 1, 1 solution: Youth hiring assistance extended until end of 2022*. Retrieved 30/11/2022 from <https://www.service-public.fr/particuliers/actualites/A14189?lang=en>
- Republique Francaise. (undated). *Committee for the evaluation of the the French recovery plan "France Relance"*. Retrieved 30/11/2022 from <https://www.strategie.gouv.fr/english/articles/committee-evaluation-french-recovery-plan-france-relance>