



UNCOVER

Usher Network for COVID-19
Evidence Reviews

Summary: What is the evidence for transmission of COVID-19
by children [or in schools]?

Date: 2 July 2020

Version: 001-04



THE UNIVERSITY
of EDINBURGH

usher
institute

Title: What is the evidence for transmission of COVID-19 by children [or in schools]?

Summary answer:

Despite librarian-supported duplicate searches by experienced reviewers, no high quality studies directly addressing the study question were identified. There is very limited evidence of transmission of SARS-CoV-2 from children (based on a case report where there was COVID-19 confirmed transmission from one child to family members in China (Key Reference [KR1]) and two pupils infecting another pupil after close contact in a high school in Australia [KR2]). When updating the review (up to 21st June 2020), we did not identify more studies that reported documented cases of SARS-CoV-2 transmission by children.

It is estimated that the proportion of infected children with latent asymptomatic or with mild symptoms of respiratory or gastrointestinal illness is higher than in adults and some studies highlight that young people and children may be important sources of asymptomatic transmission. An investigation on environmental contamination in the isolation room of an infected infant confirmed that a generally well infant with COVID-19 can contaminate the environment with PCR-detectable virus [KR3]. In addition, there is risk of transmission by infected children (with virus in nasal secretions and stools). At least 4 studies have shown that children show a longer faecal shedding time than adults (and in some cases that was longer than 4 weeks) [KR4-7]. A retrospective cohort study in China demonstrated that about 33.3% of paediatric patients persisted with faecal shedding for 14 days after discharged from hospitals [KR7]. A study of 3,712 COVID-19 patients analysed the variance of viral loads in patients of different age categories [KR8]. They initially reported a similar viral load in children as in adults [KR8], however, their updated report showed that young children (<10 years old) had statistically significant lower viral load [KR9]. A hospital-based study in South Korea examined the viral load among 12 infected children and demonstrated that symptomatic children had higher initial viral load in nasopharyngeal swab specimens than asymptomatic children, but found no differences in faeces and saliva specimens [KR10]. Similarly, another study of 35 paediatric patients reported that the median SARS CoV-2 viral load was higher in symptomatic than asymptomatic paediatric patients, and patients <5y had higher viral loads and were more likely to be symptomatic [KR11]. The findings corroborated the prior studies demonstrating correlation between viral load and disease severity in younger children.

It is widely reported that children can get infected after exposure to confirmed cases, through household or travel contacts. Perinatal infection can also occur when the baby is born to a pregnant woman with confirmed infection via vaginal delivery, while vertical transmission from mother to infant or via breastfeeding have not yet been established. An outbreak around a French school was reported, where they found that 40% of pupils and staff became infected with no difference between the two groups [KR12]. Almost all the students in the study were aged 15-17 years of age, who appear to have similar disease characteristics to adults. A report from New South Wales, from March to mid-April 2020, identified 18 individuals (9 pupils and 9 staff) from 15 schools that were confirmed COVID-19 cases. A total of 735 pupils and 128 staff were close contacts of these initial 18 cases. No teacher or staff member contracted COVID-19 from any of the initial school cases. One child from a primary school and one child from a high school may have contracted COVID-19 from the initial cases at their schools [KR2]. A cross-sectional study in Belgium examined the transmission risk of SARS-CoV-2 in day-care settings, they randomly sampled 84 children who were attending day-care after the outbreak of COVID-19, and found no asymptomatic carriage of SARS-CoV-2 among young children [KR13]. Another school-based tracing study in Ireland examined all reported paediatric cases of COVID-19 attending school during the pre-symptomatic and symptomatic periods of infection (n = 3) and did not identify any cases of onward transmission to other children or adults within the school and a variety of other settings [KR14].

Targeted (n=9,199) and random population screening (n=13,607) from Iceland found that children under 10 years of age were less likely to receive a positive result than were persons 10 years of age or older (6.7% vs 13.7% for targeted testing; and 0% vs. 0.8% for random population testing) [KR15]. The Italian principality of Vo tested >85% of their population following their first death from COVID-19, and found no positive cases in children despite 2.6% of the population being positive [KR16]. A demographic breakdown of the first 7,755 laboratory confirmed cases in South Korea (where more

extensive community testing has been implemented) showed that only 1% of the confirmed cases were <10 years old and 5.2% were 10-19 years old [KR17]. A study in the Netherlands is undertaking community serology testing for antibodies against SARS-CoV-2 and in their first release of preliminary results they have found 4.2% of adults are positive compared to 2% of those aged <20 years [KR18]. Finally, a COVID-19 Antibody Seroprevalence Study in Santa Clara County, California showed that positivity of the antibody test was not different across different age groups (but children were from the same household of the adults that were selected for testing) [KR19]. A newly identified study analysed the global COVID-19 prevalence for 23 countries with data available for paediatric cases; it is reported that about 1.9% (8,113 out of 424,978) of confirmed COVID-19 cases were children; the admission rate was 3.9% and the ICU admission rate was 0.3% among paediatric patients [KR20]. Another study examined age-specific COVID-19 data which had been collated from official government sources for seven countries (USA, UK, Italy, Germany, Spain, France and Korea); up to 2020/05/19, a total of 42,864 confirmed paediatric cases (0-19 years) were reported in these seven countries, and 26.4% of them were under 10 years old [KR21].

Available evidence suggests that children may have more upper respiratory tract (including nasopharyngeal carriage) than lower respiratory tract involvement. Their prognosis is generally better than that in adults. An ISARIC WHO study of 16,749 hospitalised UK patients with COVID-19 from 166 UK hospitals found that only 2% of the patients were under 18 years old (n=239 patients) and only 1.1% were under 5 years old (n=139 patients) [KR22]. A nationwide case-series of 2135 paediatric patients with COVID-19 reported to the Chinese Centre for Disease Control and Prevention found that more than 90% of all patients had asymptomatic, mild, or moderate symptoms. The proportions of severe and critical cases was highest in the age group <1 years old (10.6%) followed by the 1-5 years old category (7.3%) [KR23]. However, a new paediatric multisystem inflammatory syndrome has been identified and temporally associated with COVID-19. A small number of children that developed a significant systemic inflammatory response have recently been identified in the UK, the US, France, Italy, Spain and Switzerland. This has triggered the release of a new guidance from the Royal College of Paediatrics and Child Health [KR24]. Research on this topic is currently on going (DIAMONDS, ISARIC) and a new study from the British Paediatric Surveillance Unit will be launching soon. There are at least 4 new studies reporting on the SARS-CoV-2-related inflammatory multisystem syndrome among paediatric patients in Italy, France, UK and USA [KR25-28].

Disclaimer: This rapid review has not been peer-reviewed and we have not conducted quality assessment of the included studies. Many of the included studies are pre-print publications or reports and therefore not peer-reviewed either. This review should not replace individual clinical judgement and the sources cited should be checked. The views expressed represent those of the authors and are not a substitute for professional medical advice.

Extended abstract:

We run searches in PubMed, medRxiv and WHO COVID-19 database to identify relevant studies reporting on the SARS-COV-2 transmission routes among infected (both symptomatic and asymptomatic) children and adolescences. This update covers the period up to 21 June 2020. The literature screening was shared between five reviewers (XL, WX, YH, AK, LZ). Each new title, abstract and full text was screened by one reviewer. A total of 2,034 publications were retrieved. After parallel review, a total of 83 unique studies were included: 2 studies (1, 2) reported documented cases of SARS-COV-2 transmission by children; 14 studies presenting indirect evidence on the potential of SARS-COV-2 transmission by children (3-16); 8 studies exploring school/day-care outbreaks or tracing close contacts of SARS-COV-2 COVID transmission in school settings (2, 17-23); and 4 studies reporting on the SARS-CoV-2-related inflammatory multisystem syndrome among paediatric patients (24-27). We also found 56 studies (28-83), that addressed a relevant research question (i.e proportion of children infected identified through random or targeted population testing) and we also report results from a large hospital based study from the UK (29) and a nation-wide case-series from China (83). We additionally found 51 reviews (84-134) exploring the transmission of COVID-19 infection among children and 1 policy brief from the Swiss National Science Task Force (135). References of previous reviews and briefs were searched by four reviewers (YH, WX, XL, ET). We have included these studies, but we plan to expand the scope of our review to systematically search for this and other relevant

research questions (including studies on attack rate of the disease in children and modelling studies on the effect of school closures).

All the references are presented in a separate file. Please see below the references of the evidence highlighted in the summary answer.

Conclusions: There is very limited evidence of paediatric cases as a source of infection, which highlights the importance of obtaining robust data on this. Preliminary results from large targeted, population and school studies show that children (especially younger children) are less likely to be infected or infect others, and other studies show a lower viral load in children than in adults. Faecal-oral transmission by infected children is possible, given the observed faecal shedding time, which may have substantial implications for community spread in day-care centres, schools, and homes.

Link to full review and any relevant updates: <https://edin.ac/children>

Date completed: 3 July 2020

Contact details of lead reviewers: Prof Evropi Theodoratou (e.theodoratou@ed.ac.uk); Dr Xue Li; Wei Xu; Yazhou He; Dr Amir Kirolos, Zhongyu Lang

Key references:

1. Cai J, Xu J, Lin D, et al. A Case Series of children with 2019 novel coronavirus infection: clinical and epidemiological features [published online ahead of print, 2020 Feb 28]. *Clin Infect Dis*. 2020;ciaa198. doi:10.1093/cid/ciaa198
2. National Centre for Immunisation Research and Surveillance (NCIRS). COVID-19 in schools – the experience in NSW. 2020. http://ncirs.org.au/sites/default/files/2020-04/NCIRS%20NSW%20Schools%20COVID_Summary_FINAL%20public_26%20April%202020.pdf. Accessed 26 Apr 2020.
3. Yung CF, Kam KQ, Wong MSY, et al. Environment and Personal Protective Equipment Tests for SARS-CoV-2 in the Isolation Room of an Infant With Infection [published online ahead of print, 2020 Apr 1]. *Ann Intern Med*. 2020;M20-0942. doi:10.7326/M20-0942
4. Xing Y-H, Ni W, Wu Q, et al. Prolonged Viral Shedding in Feces of Pediatric Patients with Coronavirus Disease 2019. *Journal of Microbiology, Immunology and Infection*. 2020. doi.org/10.1016/j.jmii.2020.03.021
5. Xu Y, Li X, Zhu B, et al. Characteristics of pediatric SARS-CoV-2 infection and potential evidence for persistent fecal viral shedding. *Nature Medicine*. 2020. doi: 10.1038/s41591-020-0817-4
6. Ma X, Su L, Zhang Y, Zhang X, Gai Z, Zhang Z. Do children need a longer time to shed SARS-CoV-2 in stool than adults? [published online ahead of print, 2020 Mar 19]. *J Microbiol Immunol Infect*. 2020;. doi:10.1016/j.jmii.2020.03.010
7. Hua CZ, Miao ZP, Zheng JS, Huang Q, Sun QF, Lu HP, et al. Epidemiological features and viral shedding in children with SARS-CoV-2 infection. *Journal of medical virology*. 2020.
8. Terry C, Jones, Barbara M, et al. An analysis of SARS-CoV-2 viral load by patient age. 2020. https://zoosenen.charite.de/fileadmin/user_upload/microsites/m_cc05/virologie-ccm/dateien_upload/Weitere_Dateien/analysis-of-SARS-CoV-2-viral-load-by-patient-age.pdf. Accessed 06 May 2020.
9. https://medium.com/@d_spiegel/is-sars-cov-2-viral-load-lower-in-young-children-than-adults-8b4116d28353. Accessed 26 May 2020
10. Han MS, Seong MW, Kim N, Shin S, Cho SI, Park H, et al. Viral RNA Load in Mildly Symptomatic and Asymptomatic Children with COVID-19, Seoul. *Emerging infectious diseases*. 2020;26(10)
11. Pandey U, Yee R, Precit M, Bootwalla M, Ryutov A, Shen L, et al. Pediatric COVID-19 in Southern California: clinical features and viral genetic diversity. medRxiv. 2020:2020.05.28.20104539.
12. Arnaud F, Laura T, Yoann M, et al. Cluster of COVID-19 in northern France: A retrospective closed cohort study. 2020. *medRxiv* 2020.04.18.20071134; doi: doi.org/10.1101/2020.04.18.20071134
13. Desmet S, Ekinici E, Wouters I, Decru B, Beuselinck K, Malhotra-Kumar S, et al. No SARS-CoV-2 carriage observed in children attending daycare centers during the first weeks of the epidemic in Belgium. medRxiv. 2020:2020.05.13.20095190.
14. Heavey L, Casey G, Kelly C, Kelly D, McDarby G. No evidence of secondary transmission of COVID-19 from children attending school in Ireland, 2020. *Euro surveillance : bulletin Europeen sur les maladies transmissibles = European communicable disease bulletin*. 2020;25(21).
15. Gudbjartsson DF, Helgason A, Jonsson H, et al. Spread of SARS-CoV-2 in the Icelandic Population [published online ahead of print, 2020 Apr 14]. *N Engl J Med*. 2020;NEJMoa2006100. doi:10.1056/NEJMoa2006100
16. Enrico L, Elisa F, Constanze C, et al. Suppression of COVID-19 outbreak in the municipality of Vo, Italy. 2020. *medRxiv* 2020.04.17.20053157; doi: 10.1101/2020.04.17.20053157
17. COVID-19 National Emergency Response Center, Epidemiology and Case Management Team, Korea Centers for Disease Control and Prevention. Coronavirus Disease-19: The First 7,755 Cases in the Republic of Korea. *Osong Public Health Res Perspect*. 2020;11(2):85 - 90. doi:10.24171/j.phrp.2020.11.2.05

18. National Institute for Public Health and Environment. Children and COVID-19. 2020. <https://www.rivm.nl/en/novel-coronavirus-covid-19/children-and-covid-19>. Accessed 05 May 2020.
19. Eran B, Bianca M, Neeraj S, et al. COVID-19 Antibody Seroprevalence in Santa Clara County, California. *medRxiv*. 2020.04.14.20062463; doi: 10.1101/2020.04.14.20062463
20. Barton Forbes M, Mehta K, Kumar K, Lu J, Le Saux N, Sampson M, et al. COVID- 19 Infection in Children: Estimating Pediatric Morbidity and Mortality. *medRxiv*. 2020:2020.05.05.20091751.
21. Bhopal S, Bagaria J, Bhopal R. Children's mortality from COVID-19 compared with all-deaths and other relevant causes of death: epidemiological information for decision-making by parents, teachers, clinicians and policymakers. *Public health*. 2020;185:19-20.
22. Annemarie BD, Ewen MH, Christopher AG, et al. Features of 16,749 hospitalised UK patients with COVID-19 using the ISARIC WHO Clinical Characterisation Protocol. *medRxiv*. 2020.04.23.20076042; doi: 10.1101/2020.04.23.20076042
23. Dong Y, Mo X, Hu Y, et al. Epidemiology of COVID-19 Among Children in China *Pediatrics* April 2020, e20200702; DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1542/peds.2020-0702>
24. <https://www.rcpch.ac.uk/sites/default/files/2020-05/COVID-19-Paediatric-multisystem-%20inflammatory%20syndrome-20200501.pdf>. Accessed 05 May 2020
25. Verdoni L, Mazza A, Gervasoni A et al. An outbreak of severe Kawasaki-like disease at the Italian epicentre of the SARS-CoV-2 epidemic: an observational cohort study. *Lancet* 2020; 395: 1771–78
26. Grimaud M, Starck J, Levy M et al. Acute Myocarditis and Multisystem Inflammatory Emerging Disease Following SARS-CoV-2 Infection in Critically Ill Children. *Ann Intensive Care* 2020 Jun 1;10(1):69
27. Whittaker E, Bamford A, Kenny J, et al. Clinical Characteristics of 58 Children With a Pediatric Inflammatory Multisystem Syndrome Temporally Associated With SARS-CoV-2. *JAMA*. Published online June 8, 2020. doi:10.1001/jama.2020.10369
28. Cheung EW, Zachariah P, Gorelik M et al. Multisystem Inflammatory Syndrome Related to COVID-19 in Previously Healthy Children and Adolescents in New York City. *JAMA*. Published online June 8, 2020. doi:10.1001/jama.2020.10374